



January 10, 2013

The Honorable Joseph P. Biden, Vice President of the United States of America and Gun Violence Commission Members:

The massacre of schoolchildren in Newtown, Connecticut on December 14, 2012, coming on the heels of mass homicides in Aurora (Colorado), Tucson (Arizona), and Oak Creek (Wisconsin), has fostered a new sense of urgency regarding the prevention of gun violence. Based on measures of violent crime such as assault and robbery, the United States is no more violent than many other industrial democracies. What does set the United States apart is the much greater likelihood of gun involvement in the violence that we do have, which leads the U.S. to have a homicide rate that is dramatically higher than that of other Western democracies that have similar rates of other violent crimes.<sup>1</sup> Medical treatment of gunshot wounds costs an estimated \$2 billion annually, half of which comes from taxpayer dollars.<sup>2</sup> The total costs of gun violence to American society are on the order of \$100 billion per year.<sup>3</sup>

The tragedy of gun violence is compounded by the fact that the usual methods for addressing a public health and safety threat of this magnitude—collection of basic data, scientific inquiry, policy formation, policy analysis and rigorous evaluation—are, because of politically-motivated constraints, extremely difficult in the area of firearm research. A blue-ribbon commission appointed by the National Academy of Sciences concluded that very little is currently known about effective ways to reduce gun violence.<sup>4</sup> One consequence is that our current approach of “muddling through” has led to little long-term progress in addressing this problem: While mortality rates from almost every major cause of death declined dramatically over the past half century, the homicide rate in America today is almost exactly the same as it was in 1950.

As researchers in the areas of crime, medicine, public health, economics and public policy, we are writing to offer our assistance to the Commission and to provide our collective recommendations to help ensure there can be “meaningful action,” as was promised in the Commission’s creation. We also summarize two key recommendations for immediate actions that command broad and deep consensus within the violence-prevention research community.

**RECOMMENDATION ONE: We call for the removal of the current barriers to firearm-related research, policy formation, evaluation and enforcement efforts.**

**RECOMMENDATION TWO: We call on the federal government to make direct investments in unbiased scientific research and data infrastructure.**

Below we elaborate on both of these recommendations.

---

<sup>1</sup> Zimring, F. E., & Hawkins, G. (1999). *Crime is Not the Problem: Lethal Violence in America*. New York: Oxford University Press.

<sup>2</sup> Cook, P. J. (2012) “Updated estimates for the medical costs of gunshot injuries in the US, building off Cook and Ludwig 1999, JAMA.” Unpublished working paper, Sanford School of Public Policy, Duke University.

<sup>3</sup> Cook, P. J., & Ludwig, J. (2002). *Gun Violence: The Real Costs*. New York: Oxford University Press.

<sup>4</sup> Wellford, C. F., Pepper, J. V., & Petrie, C. V. (2004). *Firearms and Violence A Critical Review*. Washington: National Academies Press.

**RECOMMENDATION ONE: Remove the current barriers to firearm-related research, policy formation, evaluation, and enforcement efforts.**

- **Lift existing restrictions on the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) and the National Institutes of Health (NIH) regarding the study of firearm-related injuries.** Gun policy research and evaluation should be carried out through the normal processes of scientific peer-review employed in other important areas of clinical medicine and public health. Removal of constraints on research would send an important message to both federal officials and the research community regarding their independence from political and ideological interference in the research process. It is especially important to reinforce this message given the particular history of gun policy, which includes efforts to eliminate or de-fund CDC's firearm injury research.<sup>5</sup> The CDC is the nation's premier public health agency, but its website lacks specific links to information about preventing firearm-related violence, despite the fact that firearm violence is a leading cause of death in the United States and *the* leading cause of death for African Americans age 15-24.

Subsection c of section 503 and 218 of FY2013 Appropriations Act governing NIH and CDC funding still contains the language: "None of the funds made available in this title may be used, in whole or in part, to advocate or promote gun control."<sup>6,7</sup> Federal scientific funds should not be used to advance ideological agendas on any topic. Yet that legislative language has the effect of discouraging the funding of well-crafted scientific studies.

- **The Federal Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives (ATF) should be provided the resources and authority to more effectively address firearm-related crime. Of particular importance to the research community is lifting the restrictions on release of ATF firearm trace data.** The Tiahrt Amendments, originally passed in 2003 as part of the ATF's federal appropriations and passed in some version every year since, hinder law enforcement efforts to aggressively pursue criminals who buy and sell illegal guns and greatly limit the development of effective policy. Historically, ATF trace data analysis carried out by trained researchers and analysts has been an important tool to help develop policy and enforcement approaches to help curb illegal trafficking. ATF's annual "Youth Crime Gun Interdiction Initiative Trace Reports" (1997-2002) and the 2000 report "Following the Gun: Enforcing Federal Laws Against Firearms Traffickers," for example, provided valuable analysis of thousands of gun trafficking investigations which helped law enforcement and policy makers understand the channels through which guns are trafficked, which guns are typically trafficked, and the common characteristics of persons involved in trafficking.

The ATF has also been hampered in multiple other ways from accomplishing its mission related to firearms. It has lacked a permanent director for more than six years—since the National Rifle Association successfully lobbied Congress to require the position of director go through Senate confirmation. ATF's budget has been unduly limited, stagnating while other federal law enforcement agencies, such as the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), have seen dramatic expansions in their budget. Today ATF has fewer agents than it did nearly four decades ago. ATF also lacks sufficient regulatory authority needed to address gun crime. For example ATF lacks the authority to require regular inventory checks to detect loss and theft

---

<sup>5</sup> <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?articleid=1487470>

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.cdc.gov/obesity/downloads/Anti-Lobbying-Restrictions-for-CDC-Grantees-July2012-508.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://grants.nih.gov/grants/guide/notice-files/not-od-12-034.html>

of guns from licensed gun dealers,<sup>8</sup> and has not been allowed to computerize records of gun sales despite the growth of the gun industry and the nation's population.

**RECOMMENDATION TWO: Make direct investments in unbiased scientific research and data infrastructure.**

- **Congress should increase funding to relevant federal agencies for the specific purpose of studying, developing and evaluating policy and practice aimed at reducing firearm violence.** As shown in Figure 1 below, existing federal funding is far below the levels warranted by the enormous impact of gun violence in the United States. In the absence of such funding, basic and applied research in this area has been paltry and to the extent it has been carried out it has been only through the support of a small group of private philanthropic funders which is hardly a reliable, sustainable or responsible means for our nation to tackle one of the most pressing public health problems we currently face. NIH has a tremendous opportunity and an imperative to provide sustained support for high-quality, credible research in this area.

**Figure 1: Major NIH research awards and cumulative morbidity for select conditions in the US,**

1973–2012 <sup>9,10,11</sup>		
Condition	Total cases	NIH research awards
Cholera	400	212
Diphtheria	1337	56
Polio	266	129
Rabies	65	89
<i>Total of four diseases</i>	2068	486
Firearm injuries	>4,000,000	3

- **The National Violent Death Reporting System should be implemented in all 50 states.** The CDC's National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS) is not yet fully implemented, despite the National Academy of Sciences strong endorsement of this program and call for full scale implementation in its 2004 report on firearm violence. This state-based unified surveillance system collects facts from different sources (death certificates, police reports, coroner/medical examiner reports, and crime laboratories) about the same violent incident for use by state and local violence prevention practitioners. NVDRS currently only operates in 18 states. A fully-implemented NVDRS would greatly improve the data infrastructure for violence prevention research.

The Gun Violence Commission can help open doors for research organizations and government agencies to collect and disseminate timely, accurate, and complete information about firearm violence in the United States. This will enable researchers in criminology, public policy, public health, and allied fields to judiciously assess what works and what does not work in preventing mass shootings, but also in preventing the much more

<sup>8</sup> A 2007 investigation found that 30,000 guns were missing from dealer inventories after an inspection of only 9.3% of firearms dealers (<http://www.mayorsagainstillegalguns.org/html/federal/tiaht.shtml>)

<sup>9</sup> Branas, C., Wiebe, D., Schwab, C. & Richmond, T. (2005) Getting past the "f" word in federally funded public health research, *Injury Prevention* 11(3): 191.

<sup>10</sup> <http://projectreporter.nih.gov/reporter.cfm>

<sup>11</sup> Calculated updated numbers for 2002 -2012 for cholera and rabies using average case occurrences per year

common forms of homicide, suicide, and other gun violence that account for the preponderance of gun deaths and injuries. The current data-access and funding obstacles highlighted in this letter hamper law enforcement efforts to keep guns out of the hands of criminals, youth and other prohibited possessors. They also impede homeland security efforts to keep military-style weapons out of the hands of potential terrorists and participants in transnational organized crime. These obstacles also interfere with the efforts of medical and public health professionals to provide sound advice about gun access and storage to patients and the general public.

The recommendations offered in this letter are crucial for data-driven policy, practice, and evaluation, which have become the norm in most other areas of public policy, and they command broad consensus among leading scholars within the public health, medical, criminology, economics, and public policy fields. Acting on these recommendations is crucial for building the evidence necessary to reduce gun crime and violence in the United States.

Signed, †

Anthony A. Braga  
Don M. Gottfredson Professor of Evidence-Based Criminology  
Rutgers University  
& Senior Research Fellow in the Program in Criminal Justice  
Harvard University

Philip J. Cook <sup>a</sup>  
ITT / Sanford Professor of Public Policy  
Duke University

Jens Ludwig <sup>a</sup>  
McCormick Foundation Professor of Social Service Administration, Law, and Public Policy  
University of Chicago

Andrew V. Papachristos  
Associate Professor of Sociology  
Yale University

Henry J. Aaron <sup>a b d</sup>  
Senior Fellow, Economic Studies  
& The Bruce and Virginia MacLaury Chair  
Brookings Institution

David S. Abrams  
Assistant Professor of Law, Business Economics, and Public Policy  
University of Pennsylvania Law School and the Wharton School

---

† Title and affiliation are for identification purposes only, and does not indicate or imply organizational or institutional endorsement.

Ameena Ahmed, MD MPH  
Assistant Clinical Professor  
Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics  
University of California, San Francisco

Catherine Barber  
Senior Researcher, Harvard Injury Control Research Center  
Harvard School of Public Health

Nathaniel Baum-Snow  
Associate Professor, Economics and Urban Studies  
Brown University

Richard Berk  
Professor of Criminology and Statistics  
University of Pennsylvania

Christopher Berry, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
University of Chicago Harris School of Public Policy

Leah Boustan  
Associate Professor, UCLA Department of Economics  
University of California, Los Angeles

Ra'anan Boustan  
Associate Professor, Department of History  
University of California, Los Angeles

Charles C. Branas  
Professor of Epidemiology  
University of Pennsylvania

Ethan Bueno de Mesquita  
Professor, Harris School of Public Policy  
University of Chicago

Scott Burris  
Professor and Co-Director, Center for Health Law, Policy and Practice  
Temple University Beasley School of Law

Kerwin Charles  
Edwin and Betty L. Bergman Distinguished Service Professor  
University of Chicago

Rose Cheney  
Adjunct Assistant Professor of Surgery  
& Executive Director, Firearm & Injury Center at Penn  
University of Pennsylvania

Emil F. Coccaro, MD  
E.C. Manning Professor and Chair, Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Neuroscience  
Biological Sciences Division  
University of Chicago

Martha A.Q. Curley, RN, PhD, FAAN  
Ellen and Robert Kapito Professor in Nursing Science, School of Nursing  
Anesthesia and Critical Care Medicine  
University of Pennsylvania

Janet Currie  
Henry Putnam Professor of Economics and Policy Affairs  
& Director, Center for Health and Wellbeing  
Princeton University

Gretchen Cusick, Ph.D.  
Research Director  
University of Chicago Crime Lab & University of Chicago Urban Education Lab

Patricia D'Antonio, PhD, RN, FAAN  
Killebrew-Censits Endowed Term Associate Professor in Undergraduate Education  
University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing

Thomas DeLeire  
Professor of Public Affairs and Economics Director, La Follette School of Public Affairs  
University of Wisconsin-Madison

David Deming  
Assistant Professor of Education and Economics  
Harvard Graduate School of Education

Carlos Dobkin  
Associate Professor, Department of Economics  
University of California, Santa Cruz

John J. Donohue<sup>b</sup>  
C. Wendell and Edith M. Carlsmith Professor of Law  
Stanford Law School

Mary Ann Dutton, PhD  
Professor, Department of Psychiatry  
Georgetown University Medical Center

Beth E. Ebel, MD, MSc, MPH  
Associate Professor of Pediatrics  
University of Washington and Seattle Children's Hospital  
& Adjunct Associate Professor of Epidemiology  
University of Washington School of Public Health

Joel A. Fein M.D., M.P.H.  
Attending Physician, Emergency Department  
The Children's Hospital of Philadelphia  
& Professor of Pediatrics and Emergency Medicine  
University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine

Howard Frumkin, MD, Dr.P.H.  
Dean, School of Public Health  
University of Washington

Richard J. Gelles, PhD  
Dean  
& Joanne and Raymond Welsh Chair of Child Welfare and Family Violence  
University of Pennsylvania School of Social Policy & Practice

Jeane Ann Grisso, MD, M.Sc.  
Professor of Medicine and Nursing  
University of Pennsylvania

Jonathan Gruber <sup>a b</sup>  
Professor of Economics, MIT Department of Economics  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Jonathan Guryan  
Associate Professor of Human Development and Social Policy  
& of Economics  
Northwestern University

Benjamin Hansen  
Assistant Professor, Department of Economics  
University of Oregon

Eric Hanushek  
Senior Fellow, Hoover Institution  
Stanford University

Stephen Hargarten, MD, MPH <sup>a</sup>  
Professor and Chair, Emergency Medicine  
Medical College of Wisconsin

David Hemenway, PhD  
Professor of Health Policy  
& Director, Harvard Injury Control Research Center  
Harvard School of Public Health

Judd E. Hollander, MD  
Professor  
& Clinical Research Director, Department of Emergency Medicine  
University of Pennsylvania

Brian A. Jacob  
Walter H. Annenberg Professor of Education Policy, Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy  
University of Michigan

Lawrence Katz <sup>b</sup>  
Allison Professor of Economics, Department of Economics  
Harvard University

Stephen Kimmel, MD, MSCE  
Professor of Medicine and Epidemiology  
University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine

Mark A.R. Kleiman  
Professor of Public Policy  
University of California, Los Angeles

Kelli A. Komro, MPH, PhD  
Professor, Health Outcomes and Policy, College of Medicine  
& Associate Director, Institute for Child Health Policy  
& University of Florida Research Foundation Professor  
University of Florida

Margaret E. Kruk, MD, MPH  
Assistant Professor of Health Policy and Management  
Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health

Ilyana Kuziemko  
Associate Professor, Finance and Economics  
Columbia Business School



Benjamin B. Lahey  
Irving B. Harris Professor of Epidemiology, Psychiatry, and Behavioral Neuroscience  
Department of Health Studies  
University of Chicago

David S. Lee  
Professor of Economics and Public Affairs  
Princeton University

Jean Lemaire  
Director, Actuarial Science Program  
University of Pennsylvania, Wharton School

Phillip B. Levine  
Katherine Coman and A. Barton Hepburn Professor  
& Chair, Department of Economics  
Wellesley College

Robert Lipton, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Injury Center, Department of Emergency Medicine  
University of Michigan

John List <sup>b</sup>  
Homer J. Livingston Professor of Economics  
University of Chicago

Adriana Lleras-Muney  
Economics Professor  
University of California, Los Angeles

Susanna Loeb  
Barnett Family Professor of Education  
& Director, Center for Education Policy Analysis  
Stanford University

John M. MacDonald  
Associate Professor  
& Chair, Department of Criminology  
& Academic Policy Committee, Fels Institute of Government  
& Research Associate, Population Studies Center  
& Director, Jerry Lee Center of Criminology  
University of Pennsylvania

W. Bentley MacLeod  
Sami Mnaymneh Professor of Economics  
& Professor of International & Public Affairs  
Columbia University

Keith Martin, MD  
Executive Advisor  
Consortium of Universities for Global Health

Michael S. McCloskey  
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology  
Temple University

Justin McCrary  
Professor of Law  
University of California, Berkeley

Thomas G. McGuire <sup>a</sup>  
Professor of Health Economics, Department of Health Care Policy  
Harvard Medical School

Tracey L. Meares <sup>e</sup>  
Walton Hale Hamilton Professor of Law  
Yale Law School

Afaf I. Meleis, PhD, DrPS (hon), FAAN <sup>a</sup>  
Margaret Bond Simon Dean of Nursing  
& Professor of Nursing and Sociology  
University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing

Edward Miguel  
Oxfam Professor of Environmental and Resource Economics  
& Director, Center for Effective Global Action  
University of California, Berkeley

Matthew Miller, M.D., M.P.H., Sc.D  
Associate Professor of Health Policy and Management  
Harvard School of Public Health

Mary D. Naylor, PhD, FAAN, RN <sup>a</sup>  
Marian S. Ware Professor in Gerontology  
& Director, NewCourtland Center for Transitions and Health  
University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing

Mallory O'Brien, PhD  
Founding Director  
Milwaukee Homicide Review Commission  
& Clinical Assistant Professor  
Marquette University College of Nursing

J. Michael Oakes, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
& Co-Director, U.S. Census Data Research Center  
Division of Epidemiology & Community Health  
University of Minnesota

Emily Greene Owens  
Assistant Professor, Department of Policy Analysis and Management  
Cornell University

Harold Pollack  
Helen Ross Professor of Social Service Administration  
Center for Health Administration Studies  
University of Chicago

Keramet A. Reiter  
Assistant Professor of Criminology, Law & Society and of Law  
University of California, Irvine

Therese S. Richmond, PhD, CRNP  
Andrea B. Laporte Endowed Term Professor  
University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing

Barbara Riegel, DNSc, RN  
Professor and Edith Clemmer Steinbright Chair of Gerontology  
& Director, Biobehavioral Research Center  
University of Pennsylvania School of Nursing

Frederick P. Rivara, MD, MPH <sup>a</sup>  
Seattle Children's Guild Endowed Chair in Pediatrics  
& Professor and Vice Chair, Department of Pediatrics  
& Adjunct Professor of Epidemiology  
University of Washington

Christopher J. Ruhm  
Professor of Public Policy and Economics, Frank Batten School of Leadership and Public Policy  
University of Virginia

Robert J. Sampson<sup>b c e</sup>  
Henry Ford II Professor of the Social Sciences  
Harvard University  
& Director of the Social Sciences Program  
Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study

Richard W. Sattin, MD, FACP  
President  
Society for Advancement of Violence and Injury Research

C. William Schwab  
Professor of Surgery  
University of Pennsylvania

Patrick Sharkey  
Associate Professor of Sociology  
New York University

Diana Silver, PhD, MPH  
Assistant Professor of Public Health  
New York University Steinhardt School

Wesley G. Skogan  
Professor, Institute for Policy Research  
Northwestern University

Herbert L. Smith  
Professor of Sociology  
Director, Population Studies Center  
University of Pennsylvania

Marilyn S. Sommers  
Lillian S. Brunner Professor of Medical Surgical Nursing  
University of Pennsylvania

Susan B. Sorenson, Ph.D.  
Professor of Social Policy  
& Professor of Health & Societies  
University of Pennsylvania

Laurence Steinberg  
Distinguished University Professor  
& Laura H. Carnell Professor of Psychology  
Temple University

Betsey Stevenson  
Associate Professor of Public Policy  
Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy  
University of Michigan

Brian L. Strom, MD, MPH <sup>a</sup>  
Executive Vice Dean for Institutional Affairs  
& George S. Pepper Professor of Public Health & Preventive Medicine  
& Professor of Biostatistics and Epidemiology  
& Professor of Medicine and of Pharmacology  
University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine

Katherine Swartz <sup>a</sup>  
Professor  
Harvard School of Public Health

Linda A. Teplin, Ph.D.  
Owen L. Coon Professor  
& Vice Chair of Research  
& Director, Health Disparities and Public Policy  
Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Feinberg School of Medicine  
Northwestern University

George E. Tita  
Associate Professor, Criminology, Law and Society  
& Director, Master's in Public Policy Program  
University of California, Irvine

Petra E. Todd  
Alfred L. Cass Term Professor of Economics  
University of Pennsylvania

John Tyler  
Professor of Education, Economics, and Public Policy  
Brown University

Jon S. Vernick, JD, MPH  
Associate Professor  
& Co-Director, Johns Hopkins Center for Gun Policy and Research  
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

Alexander C. Wagenaar, PhD  
Professor, Department of Health Outcomes & Policy  
& Program Director for Strategic Initiatives  
University of Florida, College of Medicine  
& Professor, Institute for Child Health Policy  
University of Florida  
& Associate Director, Public Health Law Research Program  
Temple University

Joel Waldfogel  
Frederick R. Kappel Chair in Applied Economics  
& Affiliated Faculty Member, Department of Economics and Law School  
University of Minnesota

Daniel W. Webster, ScD, MPH  
Professor of Health Policy and Management  
& Director, Johns Hopkins Center for Gun Policy and Research  
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

David N. Weil  
James and Merryl Tisch Professor of Economics, Department of Economics  
Brown University

Billie P. Weiss, MPH  
Fielding School of Public Health  
University of California, Los Angeles

Bruce Western<sup>b d</sup>  
Professor of Sociology  
& Director, Malcolm Wiener Center for Social Policy  
Harvard University

Douglas J. Wiebe, PhD  
Associate Professor of Epidemiology, Department of Biostatistics and Epidemiology  
University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of Medicine

Katherine V. Wild, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor, Departments of Neurology & Psychiatry  
Oregon Health and Science University

Christopher Winship  
Diker-Tishman Professor of Sociology  
Harvard University

Garen Wintemute, MD, MPH  
Susan P. Baker and Stephen P. Teret Chair in Violence Prevention  
& Professor of Emergency Medicine  
University of California, Davis

Barbara Wolfe <sup>a d</sup>  
Professor of Public Affairs, Economics and Population Health Sciences  
University of Wisconsin-Madison

Justin Wolfers  
Professor of Economics and Public Policy  
University of Michigan

Miranda Worthen, PhD  
Assistant Professor of Epidemiology  
San Jose State University

Brian J. Zink, MD  
on behalf of the Association of Academic Chairs of Emergency Medicine  
Frances Weeden Gibson – Edward A. Iannuccilli, MD, Professor & Chair  
Department of Emergency Medicine  
& Assistant Dean, Medical Student Career Development  
Brown University Alpert Medical School  
& Physician-in-Chief, Emergency Medicine  
Rhode Island & The Miriam Hospitals  
& President  
University Emergency Medicine Foundation  
& President  
The Association of Academic Chairs of Emergency Medicine

Joshua Graff Zivin  
Professor of Economics and International Relations  
University of California, San Diego